

September 25, 1947

COPY OF LETTER FROM DR. ERNEST JONES: (July 22, 1947)

Dear Dr. Simmel:

I was greatly interested in your essay on anti-Semitism which overlaps mine -- also published in an omnibus book ("Gentile and Jew", edited by C. Newman, published last year by the Alliance Press, Arthur St., London, E.C. 4). It was specially interesting to see the somewhat different angle of approach from a Gentile and a Jewish psychoanalyst.

I agreed with all the conclusions of your admirably written essay. But I do not think they covered all the ground any more than mine could -- the subject is so vast. Broadly speaking, you laid more stress (too much, in my opinion) on the religious aspect while I laid more on the national or "racial" group one. Jews seem to me always equate Gentile and Christian too extensively and to forget how few Gentiles are Christians. In England, where there is plenty of anti-Semitism, hardly anyone has heard of the story, so common in Eastern Europe, of the Pesach blood sacrifices. And of course it does not account for the Roman persecution of the Jews. This was due to their refusal to join in the common traditions of the Empire and their insistence on their apartness as a people, with divine pretensions to superiority, etc. And I think that is still the main cause of anti-Semitism, the feeling that Jews are apart, disloyal, inimical to the community wherever it may be. A "Christian" country is not one whose belief in Jesus is common. It is largely a convenient ^{el}lable to cover the idea of patriotic group nationalism. In my opinion, Zionism is the main reason for the exacerbation of anti-Semitism in

the twentieth century. But I cannot expound my ideas in a letter; if possible, get hold of the book.

Of course I agree with what you say about "devouring", projection of the super-ego, etc. But I do not regard the former as only destructive. It is also motivated by the desire to absorb the father's strength oneself, and to control its dangerous impulses by possessing them in one's power (in one's body). He is not destroyed, but lives on inside as a ~~both~~ good and bad "internal object" (English school) where he ~~has~~ has a very complicated career. And, you see, the Jew is not simply an external "enemy." He also represents the bad dangerous object inside oneself, which is both oneself and at the same time a foreign body inside. The fact that ~~the~~ the Jew lives inside other nations is to me of crucial importance. That is one of the two respects (the other is the Herrenvasse claim) in which he differs from everyone else in the course of history, so that his persecution is chronic -- I do not think one can ever explain anti-Semitism if one confines oneself to the Gentile complexes. There are also the reciprocal Jewish ones.

With kind regards,

Yours very sincerely

Ernest Jones

TELEPHONE, HARTING 61.
TELEGRAMS, ELSTED, HARTING.

7 of 22nd / 47

THE PLAT,
ELSTED,
N^o MIDHURST, SX.

Dear Dr. Sarnin

I was greatly interested in your essay on Anti-Semitism, which overlaps mine - also published in an omnibus book ("Gentile and Jew", edited by C. Newman, published last year by the Alliance Press, Arthur St, London E.C. 4). It was specially interesting to see the somewhat different angle of approach from a Gentile & a Jewish psychoanalyst.

I agreed with all the conclusions of your admirably written essay. But I do not think they covered all the ground any more than mine could - the subject is so vast. Broadly speaking, you laid more stress (too much, in my opinion) on the religious aspect while I laid more on the national or "racial" group. One Jews seem to me always equate Gentile and Christian too extensively and to forget how few Gentiles are Christian. In England, where there is plenty of anti-semitism, hardly anyone has heard of the story, so common in Eastern Europe, of the Passah blood sacrifices. And of course it does not amount for the Roman persecution of the Jews. This was due to their refusal to join in the common traditions of the Empire and their insistence on their apartness as a people, with divine pretensions to superiority, etc. And I think that is still the main cause

of anti-semitism, we feel that Jews are apart, disloyal, inimical to the community wherever it may be. A "Christian" country is not one where belief in Jesus is common. It is largely a convenient label to cover the idea of patriotic group nationalistic. In my opinion Zionism is the main reason for the exacerbation of a.s. in the 20th century. But I cannot expound my ideas in a letter; if possible, get hold of the book.

Of course I agree with what you say about "devouring", ~~the~~ prospect of the super-ego, etc. But I do not regard the former as only destructive. It is also motivated by the desire to absorb the father's strength oneself, and to control its dangerous impulses by possessing them in one's power (in one's body). He is not destroyed, but lives on inside as a both good & bad "internal object" (English school) where he has a very complicated career. And, you see, the Jew is not simply an external "enemy". He also represents the bad dangerous object inside oneself, which is both oneself and at the same time a foreign body inside. The fact that the Jew lives inside other nations is to me of crucial importance. That is one of the two respects (the other is the Herenwasse ^{claim} ~~one~~) in which he differs from everyone else in the course of history, so that his persecution is chronic. I do not think one can ever explain anti-semitism if one confines oneself to the Gentile complexes; there are also the reciprocal Jewish ones.

With kind regards

Yours v. sincerely
Ernest Jones